

Carmel Design Traditions Project 1.5



CARMEL WORKSHOP #2 **Personal Workshop Handbook**



October 3, 2022

WORKSHOP #2 AGENDA

The workshop is scheduled to last 2.5 hours. High-level topics include:

- Part One – Process Update and Overview of the Strategy Paper
- Part Two – Topics related to Single Family Residential Areas
- Part Three – Topics related to the Downtown
- Part Four – Code and Administration Discussions
- Part Five – Next Steps

Workshop Handbook

Carmel Workshop #2 – Personal Workshop Handbook
October 3, 2022

INTRODUCTION

Greetings! Thank you for participating in the process to update Carmel's design guidelines.

Carmel is engaged in updating its design guidelines for the single family residential areas and the Downtown. These are key tools that shape the character of the community. In addition to updating the design guidelines, this project includes potential revisions to zoning code standards that influence design. The recommended changes are summarized in a Strategy Paper, which is available online. The highlights of the Strategy Paper are to be presented in Workshop #2 on October 3, 2022. Link to Strategy Paper:
https://drive.google.com/file/d/1yh1_90hOFohqmmzIYQ7TTX1AXu2Dpamx/view

This Workshop Handbook provides an opportunity to comment on the recommendations made in the Strategy Paper. You may add your comments during the workshop and turn it in at the end of the meeting or you may continue to add responses after the workshop. If you do so, please deliver it to the City Hall by Monday, October 10, 2022. Your responses will help to inform the drafting of the design guidelines and code changes that will follow.

For more information, contact Brandon Swanson
Email: BSwanson@cbts.us or Phone: 831-620-2024

Optional information about you:

Your name: _____

Phone: _____

Email: _____

QUESTIONS ABOUT YOU

What is your interest in Carmel? (Check all that apply)

☐ a. Full time resident in Carmel

☐ b. Part time resident in Carmel

☐ c. Property owner in Carmel

☐ d. Business owner in Carmel

☐ e. Frequent visitor to Carmel

☐ f. Other: _____

Did you participate in the Residential Design Workshop in June?

☐ Yes

☐ No

Did you participate in the Downtown Design Workshop in June?

☐ Yes

☐ No

Did you participate in the online survey that followed the workshops?

☐ Yes

☐ No

ACTIVITY #1: DESIGN IN CARMEL: ITS DESIGN TRADITIONS

The Design Guidelines in Carmel focus on maintaining the community's unique character which is so highly cherished. Some features are listed below which people describe as part of Carmel's design traditions. This list will be edited to be included in the introductions to the residential and downtown design guidelines documents.

Instructions:

1. Review the list below on your own.
2. Then answer the questions on your own.

Carmel is a Village-in-the-Forest which has these characteristics:

NEIGHBORHOOD

Subdued: No one thing is attention-grabbing; a building fits within the context of its block, its neighborhood and the city at large.

Exploratory: There is a sense of discovery along each street. One must experience a block in space and time, by moving along or through it.

Historic: A rich mix of historic and other traditional buildings, representing a range of styles is found throughout the community.

ARCHITECTURE

Genuine: A sense of authenticity is conveyed in natural building materials and design.

In scale: Buildings are human-scaled in their forms, materials and details.

Crafted: Buildings are of high quality and durable. This also is expressed in design details of buildings.

Diverse: There is variety in the range of building styles that fit in with the character of being a Village in the Forest.

Nestled: Buildings fit in with and are subordinate to the forest setting.

LANDSCAPES

Informal: Landscapes contribute to the forest character.

Walkable: Landscapes are pedestrian-scaled and enhance the public realm.

Connected: Properties connect to the public right-of-way with landscape details that extend the forest character. They are not walled off.

DOWNTOWN

Pedestrian-friendly: Buildings are human-scaled with details at the street level that invite exploration.

Open and welcoming: Storefronts, courtyards and landscapes enhance the interplay of indoor and outdoor spaces.

1.1 Does this list of Key Features capture the character of Carmel in general?

___ Yes

___ No

___ Other: _____

1.2 If needed, mark up any edits to the list that you would suggest.

1.3 Add any other features to the list that you think are important:

ACTIVITY #2: RESPECTING CARMEL'S DESIGN TRADITIONS (GUIDING PRINCIPLES)

While there are many aspects of the character of Carmel that are to be addressed in the Design Guidelines, some high level principles apply citywide and set the stage for the Design Guidelines. Those principles are listed below. (This list will be edited to be included in introductory material in the design guidelines.)

1. Maintain a healthy forest character: Plan landscapes in both the public and private realms to sustain the Village-in-a-Forest and restore areas that are in need. The compatibility of buildings also is improved with more forest-like front yards.
2. Enhance the forest: Provide layers of landscaping (varying plant and tree heights) between the street and each home and use drought-tolerant plants and fire-resistant materials while continuing to convey the forest character.
3. Keep it modest: Design buildings and landscapes to be human-scaled and fit in with their surroundings rather than stick out.
4. Respect historic precedents: Retain traditional buildings that convey the history of the community.
5. Fit with the context: "Remember your neighbors" is an important principle. This varies by neighborhood. Key design factors include:
 - Building size (height and width)
 - Building form and proportion
 - Percentage of solid-to-void (ratio of windows to wall)
 - Building materials
 - Roof form
 - Color
 - Fit with the topography
6. Pay attention to detail: Convey excellence and authenticity in materials and design. Add value with well-crafted work that is visible to the community and promote the use of natural materials.
7. Encourage a "compatible diversity" in design: Avoid repetition in building designs and site features. Express individuality in subtle ways while respecting surroundings.

Instructions:

1. First, discuss this list with your group.
2. Then, on your own, answer these questions about the Design Principles:

2.1 In general, does this list capture the principles that should set the stage for the Design Guidelines?

_____ Yes

_____ No

_____ Other: _____

2.2 Mark any edits to the list you would suggest.

2.3 Add any other principles that you believe are important to include here:

ACTIVITY #3. RESIDENTIAL DESIGN

This is an exercise to gain an understanding of how key design variables affect compatibility in Carmel. A series of images is presented as examples of residential building in the village.

A table accompanies each image; it lists some key design variables which may affect fitting in to Carmel. These variables include

- Building size
- Building height
- Building materials
- Roof form
- Color
- Front yard landscaping
- Treatment of the Right-of-Way edge

For this activity, consider the context to be somewhere in the Golden Rectangle.

Instructions:

1. Discuss the images with your table, focusing on how well each fits (or does not fit) in Carmel, considering the design variables listed. Which features fit well, fit partially or not at all? For example, the size and form of a building may fit, but the way in which materials are used may not.

2. Next, working individually in your Workbook evaluate each image using the design variables table. Note that some variables may not apply to a specific example, or they may not be visible in the image.

For each design variable, there are three different rating options from which to choose:

- ☐ Fits in
- ☐ Partially fits
- ☐ Doesn't fit

Place an X in the column that represents your opinion about the relevant variables.

Note that many of these images are ones that respondents to an earlier online survey mentioned as being compatible, in whole or in part. Others are ones that have been identified as having issues. Your individual comments will be reviewed to gain an understanding of opinions about compatibility but they will not be published.

1.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

2.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

3.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

4.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

5.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other Comments:

6.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other Comments:

7.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

8.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

9.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____
Other comments:			

10.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____
Other comments:			

11.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

12.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

13.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

14.



VARIABLE	FITS IN	PARTIALLY FITS	DOESN'T FIT
BUILDING			
Building Size	_____	_____	_____
Building height	_____	_____	_____
Building form	_____	_____	_____
Roof form	_____	_____	_____
Materials	_____	_____	_____
Windows	_____	_____	_____
Color	_____	_____	_____
SITE			
Front yard	_____	_____	_____
Fence	_____	_____	_____
Driveway	_____	_____	_____
ROW	_____	_____	_____

Other comments:

ACTIVITY #4: POLICIES FOR HISTORIC STYLES

How important is style to fitting into Carmel? In the preceding activity, we explored the way in which some design variables may influence how well a new building may fit with Carmel's design traditions. Some people have mentioned that **architectural style** also should be considered.

In this context, a building "style" is defined by a set of features that identify a building as part of a group of others with shared characteristics. The way in which building forms are composed, materials are used and details are expressed are some aspects of a style. They usually represent a particular period in time and may relate to changing fashions, the emergence of new ideas, culture, economics and technology.

An overview of some styles found traditionally in Carmel appears in the *Historic Context Statement*, which was adopted by City Council in 2008. Some of these styles are Craftsman, Comstock Tudor, Cotswold, Cape Cod and Bay Regional Modern.

Some people have stated that building designs in Carmel should be limited to the range of styles seen traditionally; others argue that evolution and change are part of Carmel's design traditions and therefore new styles should be welcomed, if they are designed to fit in. In fact, in the recent survey, two-thirds of the respondents agreed "strongly" or "somewhat" with this statement:

"A new house can fit in, regardless of 'style' if it is subdued in its character, including size, form, materials, ratio of windows to wall and color."

Instructions:

On your own, answer these questions about Architectural Style:

4.1 Historic styles of Carmel should be PERMITTED, but not required.

(That is to say that the design guidelines should not create barriers to designing in authentic historic styles and information about styles should be provided.)

___ Yes, historic styles should be permitted.

___ No, historic styles should not be permitted.

___ Not certain

Comment: _____

4.2 Designing in the historic styles of Carmel should be STRONGLY ENCOURAGED.

(The appropriate styles may vary by neighborhood, or context, but a specific list would be provided.)

___ Yes, historic styles should be required.

___ No, historic styles should not be required.

___ Not certain

Comment: _____

4.3 New, or “Modern” or “Contemporary” designs should be PERMITTED, IF they also meet guidelines for compatibility.

(They should fit in with the design variables mentioned in Activity #3, including size, materials, forms, etc.)

___ Yes, new designs should be permitted IF they meet the guidelines.

___ No, new designs should NOT be permitted.

___ Not certain

Comment: _____

ACTIVITY #5. BUILDING MATERIALS

This activity addresses the use of alternative building materials, throughout the city. Carmel has a tradition of using “natural” building materials. Wood siding, in clapboard and board-and-batten forms is an example. Real stone and hand-applied plaster are other examples. Some people have suggested that alternative, or “man-made” building materials should be permitted as well. Some of these are intended to appear similar to natural materials. Synthetic stone and fiber-cement siding are examples. Some of these may have good fire-resistance properties.

For background, in the recent online survey, 73% of respondents agreed “strongly” or “somewhat” with this statement:

“A new building in the downtown commercial area can be constructed of alternative (e.g. man-made) materials if they convey finishes and textures similar to traditional or natural materials and details.”

Instructions:

1. First, discuss the questions with your group.
2. Then, on your own, answer the questions.

5.1 In general, should alternative materials be permitted, provided that they are applied in a manner that appears similar to traditional “natural” materials?

___ Yes, alternative materials should be permitted.

___ No, alternative materials should be strongly discouraged.

___ Not certain

Comment: _____

5.2 Which are some alternative materials that should be considered?

Assuming more detail would be provided about their visual qualities, which merit consideration? (Check only those materials that should be considered.)

___ Fiber-cement siding, appearing similar to wood siding

___ Other alternative siding materials (other than fiber-cement) _____

___ Alternative roof shingles

___ Metal roofs (with muted color and low profile seams)

___ Synthetic stone

___ Other alternative material: _____

ACTIVITY #6. CONSIDERING A BULK PLANE ALTERNATIVE

An important design variable is the exterior volume of buildings on a property. An objective is to keep building size subordinate in relation to the forest and neighborhood context. How should the overall size of a building be regulated? Two alternatives are described in the Strategy Paper:

Option 1: Refine the volumetric system

If the volumetric system were continued, the numbers would be adjusted to make it easier to build with pitched roofs. The advantage of this approach is that using volumetrics is long-established and an update would be easier to understand and perhaps predict the potential outcomes.

Option 2: Change to a bulk plane (building envelope) system

In this approach, an envelope would define a three-dimensional area within which a building may occur. It could have any pitched form, to encourage sloped roofs (while also potentially permitting appropriately scaled flat roofs). This would require some study.

Instructions:

Working individually in your Workbook answer these questions:

6.1 Do you believe a Bulk Plane system should be considered as an alternative to the existing volumetric system?

☐ Yes, a Bulk Plane system should be considered.

☐ No, a Bulk Plane system should not be considered.

☐ Not certain

6.2 What benefits (if any) do you see in a Bulk Plane System?

6.3 What issues (if any) do you see in a Bulk Plane System?

6.4 What questions would you want to have answered if this is considered further?

ACTIVITY #7. WHO CONDUCTS DESIGN REVIEW?

In the previous on-line survey, a majority of respondents indicated an interest in adding a Design Review Board of some form to the design study process. However, many others preferred continuing with the Planning Commission. These were the options presented in the survey:

Option 1. Enhance the process for the Planning Commission to **continue** conducting design review. IN THE SURVEY, THIS OPTION HAD A SUBSTANTIAL NUMBER SUPPORTING IT

Option 2. Re-establish a Design Review Board as an **advisory** body. This provides a focused review but still retains the PC as the decision-making body. IN THE SURVEY, THIS OPTION HAD A SUBSTANTIAL NUMBER SUPPORTING IT.

Option 3. Establish a Design Review Board as the **decision-making** body. IN THE SURVEY, THIS OPTION DID NOT RATE AS HIGH AS THE OTHER TWO OPTIONS.

When the responses to Options 2 and 3 are combined, however, they make up a majority. That is, some form of Design Review board seems to be desired.

Instructions:

On your own, answer these questions:

7.1 Which one of these approaches would you recommend?

___ Continue with the existing system, with the Planning Commission conducting review and making design decisions

___ Add a Design Review board as an advisory body to the Planning Commission, which then would make decisions.

___ Add a Design Review board as a decision-making body.

___ Other comments? _____

7.2 What issues do you see if a Design Review Board were to be established?

7.3 What questions would you want to have answered if a Design Review Board were to be considered?

Other comments about the Strategy Paper

The Strategy Paper includes other topics that are not addressed in the Workshop and provides more detail for many of them. Do you have other comments about the Strategy Paper? Please provide them here: